```
IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 1
                     FOR THE DISTRICT OF PUERTO RICO
 2
 3
        UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,
                         Plaintiff,
 4
                                           NO: 99-CV-1435 GAG
 5
        COMMONWEALTH OF PUERTO RICO,
        PUERTO RICO POLICE DEPARTMENT,
 6
 7
                         Defendants.
 8
       TRANSCRIPT OF PART 1 - FOURTH PUBLIC HEARING ON POLICE REFORM
             HELD BEFORE THE HONORABLE JUDGE GUSTAVO A. GELPÍ
 9
         JOSÉ V. TOLEDO U.S. COURTHOUSE, OLD SAN JUAN, PUERTO RICO
            WEDNESDAY, AUGUST 10, 2016, BEGINNING AT 1:15 P.M.
10
11
      APPEARANCES:
12
13
             UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE
             Civil Rights Division, Special Litigation Section
             300 N. Los Angeles Street
14
             Federal Building, Suite 7516
             Los Angeles, California 90012
15
             BY LUIS E. SAUCEDO, ESQUIRE
             For the Plaintiffs
16
             LAW OFFICE OF GERARDO A. De-JESUS-ANNONI
17
             P.O. Box 51
             Ceiba, Puerto Rico 00735
18
             For Defendant Commonwealth of Puerto Rico and
19
             Puerto Rico Police Department
20
             DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE-FEDERAL LITIGATION DIVISION
             P.O. Box 9020192
21
             San Juan, Puerto Rico 00902
             BY JOEL TORRES-ORTÍZ
             For Defendant Commonwealth of Puerto Rico and
22
             Puerto Rico Police Department
23
      ALSO PRESENT:
24
             Sonia Cardona, Courtroom Deputy
             Carlos Lao, Spanish Interpreter
25
```

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing (The Court enters the room.) 1 2 THE COURTROOM DEPUTY: All rise. 3 The United States District Court for the 4 District of Puerto Rico is now in session. 5 Honorable Judge Gustavo A. Gelpí presiding. All those having business before this Court shall draw 6 7 near, give your attention and you shall be heard. 8 God save the United States of America and this 9 Honorable Court. (Address the public in English.) 10 11 THE COURT: Please be seated. Good afternoon. Let's have my courtroom deputy please 12 13 call the matter for this afternoon. THE COURTROOM DEPUTY: Civil case 14 15 No. 12-2039. The United States of America versus the 16 Commonwealth of Puerto Rico, et al. Set for fourth 17 public hearing. The parties will be identified by 18 the Court. 19 THE COURT: Good afternoon, everybody. 20 as a preliminary matter, as in the past three public 21 hearings, we have an English language interpreter, a 22 translator. So, all the proceedings will be 23 conducted in Spanish but there will be a simultaneous 24 translation into English for the record, as required

by the Jones Act. So, I will proceed to give myself

25

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

leave to address everybody in Spanish and everybody else who will be addressing the Court will do so in Spanish. But, again, the official record is in English and it's simultaneous. That way we will avoid interruptions and we will proceed in a much shorter manner.

(Address the public in Spanish.)

Good afternoon, to all. Thank you for being here. Above all, I want to recognize the presence of the governor of Puerto Rico. It's a pleasure for the Court. And the governor is going to be here to be able to share his experience from the context of the reform of the Police of Puerto Rico.

I want to also recognize the presence of Counsel Saucedo from the Department of Justice who is here; Attorney César Miranda, Secretary of Justice; Superintendent José Caldero, superintendent of the police and the advisor of the Department of Justice; and other personnel from the Puerto Rico Police. And we all know them very well, so I'm not going to do make a long introduction greeting each and every one.

So, just to give you a background, I want to state that this afternoon, this hearing, is probably sui generis because it's the first time that a governor in power in Puerto Rico appears of his own

over this hearing.

initiative to the United States District Court to state his opinion on an issue of such importance as the reform of the police. This not only lacks of precedence but it's a historic event, and I feel totally satisfied to have the privilege of presiding

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

Before going into specific which make this hearing very significant, I want to talk a little bit about the real reason for which we're all present here and obviously it is this police reform.

As we all know, the Puerto Rico Police began a transformation process because of the signing of the agreement between the United States and the government of the Commonwealth of Puerto Rico. This agreement for a sustainable reform of the police of Puerto Rico aspires for a fundamental change to what it means being a member of the Puerto Rico police.

So much so that it would turn the members of the police and agent into catalyst of change to keep equilibrium, a balance, between the struggle with criminal activity and statutes of the state that limit its intermission to the private lives of citizens. The Puerto Rico Police member not only has a challenge to serve the community, sustain law and order, but also ensuring that the state will observe

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing those limitations, those that we colloquially know as civil rights.

In the beginning, the agreement appears to be a list of procedures to follow and reach a professional attitude within the police career.

These instructions are organized by subjects. And these subjects are: Professionalism; use of force; search and seizures; equal protection of the laws and zero discrimination; recruitment, selection and appointments; policies and procedures; trainings; administrative supervision; internal affairs; administrative and disciplinary complaints; interaction with the community; public information; and technology information systems.

However, this agreement does not limit itself to only a list of steps. On the contrary, these are the steps that are done strategically to ensure that the goal can be reached. And one of the first goals is the training of the agency, the Puerto Rico Police.

The police accepted the responsibility of investing its first four years in developing its training to ensure the continuity of the process without the intervention of external elements to the agency. It's precisely this period in which the

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing police is in right now.

This isn't an easy task. It requires true commitment and the utmost diligence all so that the Police of Puerto Rico can reach that day in which it would be capable of tending to what is expected of them.

As an example, as recently as last week, an unexpected event came to light which put the full magnitude of the process of the Reform. The technical compliance advisor, Colonel Claudio, and Colonel Clementina Vega, who are here present, traveled to the Municipality of Peñuelas to speak to the people that were protesting in front of the Peñuelas landfill. There were also interested parties present: The company, the public. The result was that Colonel Claudio and Colonel Vega served to ensure that the participation of the police was in accordance to its duties and needs of society.

of course the situation in Peñuelas required an extraordinary situation before it became something that was irreversible. However, the office of the police reform and Superintendent Caldero and everyone acted with expediency to stabilize the situation.

And all this occurred between Sunday and Monday and it was resolved officially. So, that's an example of

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

how little by little things are done and achieved here and eventually without a monitor.

And we can appreciate that The Reform is something continuous where everybody who does work in the process does it without rest at every moment, 24 hours a day, seven days a week, 365 days a year -- and if it's a leap year, then 364.

So, this isn't a reform just on paper; it's something that has to be done completely and fully. That has been the result of the work and message going into the agreement.

As we enter into the content of the Agreement, we have to recognize that the agreement is much more than a list of orders. It's an invitation to do something that it's transcendental. It is a change of ideology, a completely radical approach to what it means to be an officer of the Puerto Rico Police. This is a great task to be done.

We must remember that governmental intercession is as resistive to change as those who would compose it. However, this is the progress that the agency wants where change has to be received and be done in an active and positive manner. Regarding this, we recognize that The Reform can be a very rigorous task to which an agency has been submitted

not only in Puerto Rico but in all the United States.
So, that's something that we recognize and we

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

3 applaud.

In the meanwhile, the Puerto Rico Police has mobilized everybody to be able to accomplish the creation of many mechanisms that simply did not exist before The Reform. For example, the policy governing the use of force, search and seizure. This policy is accompanied by the implementation of non-lethal weapons such as Taser, pepper gas, in addition to the training and design of these. If we look at the nightsticks, they're not like the ones which existed before which looked like baseball bats. They are retractable, they're not as lethal but they're just as effective. The firearm has stopped being the only alternative to deter crime.

And as a judge, I can say that I've seen a drastic reduction in the last years of cases where a police officer has been sued because of a death, and I foresee that they will continue to go down because of The Reform.

The police have also reopened the disciplinary actions in the police and they've been drafted according to the agreement. And it's something that recognizes the rights of the

complainants while they just see improvements in its procedures consistently. Training has been a notable and enviable area of progress; it's training that we can see the implementation of the best practice to adopt them to be able to do them day-by-day.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

The Puerto Rico Police also has opted to improve its relationship with the community implementing policy which safeguards the rights of all human beings be it equal protection, nondiscrimination, just like I've extended the opportunity to groups to be part of the process. The agency has also improved transparency to keep the public informed on The Reform process all for the betterment of the people of Puerto Rico.

Now, we obviously know this is a monumental task and that's why the capability-building period exists and this has also allowed the agency to learn new ideas, better practices guaranteeing constitutional rights while at the same time looking to serve the taxpayers much better helping them feel safer in their homes.

In the last two years the effort -- which I believe has been almost three years. The efforts of the parties to reach compliance with the agreement has been successful such that the parties, the

touching on all issues concerning The Reform.

monitor, and this Court have backed the efforts of the police at all times. That's why today with great expectation the Court is willing to open dialog with the governor of Puerto Rico, Honorable Alejandro García-Padilla, so that he can share his opinions

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

And we're specifically paying attention to the difficulties that he's had and the ones that will come. And I think it's very important -- and I hope that this serves as precedent that the governor in office at least once or twice every quarter can come to this court and share his perspective and ideas regarding the process; because it's not the same to have the Court mediating and ensuring that the agreement is complied with and the day-to-day negotiations of the parties and the government of Puerto Rico that certainly involves the governor. So, we hope that this is a positive precedent and the next governors who come will also appear here with some frequency.

Before presenting the governor formally -and I have a brief biography -- I'd like to take the
opportunity to present Attorney General César
Miranda, Secretary of Justice; and Attorney Luis
Saucedo from the federal Department of Justice. I'll

give you each some time to address the Court for the record. Counsel Saucedo, if you want to go first.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

MR. SAUCEDO: Good afternoon, Your Honor.

May it please the Court. Luis Saucedo for the United

States.

I want to thank Governor García-Padilla,
Secretary Miranda, Superintendent Caldero, security
advisor, all Commonwealth staff, guests, and the
technical compliance advisor for being here today.
We also want to thank the Court for holding todays
hearing to hear the governor's unique perspective on
critical reforms that are underway.

Just over three years ago, Former Attorney General Eric Holder and Governor García-Padilla at Fortaleza came together to sign this historic settlement agreement. Since signing the agreement, the parties have worked together to implement its terms and promote broad participation among stakeholders, to ensure the agreement's success. Implementation is no easy task. It will take time along with focused effort and sustained commitment, and it will take the active participation of the community.

The settlement agreement reflects many months of intense and detailed negotiations between

the Commonwealth and the Department of Justice. It charts a path forward for the Puerto Rico Police

Department to ensure the protection of civil rights.

It's important that these protections are embodied in its core values and that it's reflected as part of its policies, its training, and ultimately as part of its daily interactions with the residents of Puerto Rico. We hope the governor's remarks today help PRPD move forward towards professionalizing and modernizing the police department and ultimately towards verifiable compliance and sustainable reform.

We wish to thank the governor and his entire team for their cooperation. We recognize that Puerto Rico has continued to make significant investments in police reform even in the face of significant fiscal challenges. The governor has also continued to set a tone of collaboration between the parties and other stakeholders which has been a hallmark of this case from its inception.

We'd also like to thank all the men and women of the PRPD who are the front line of implementing this historic agreement and who have sworn to protect and serve the people of Puerto Rico. We would also like to thank all the individuals and community groups who have participated in The Reform

efforts and we look forward to working with many more. Some these individuals are here today and we know that they're looking for true change within the police department.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

We will continue to meet and hear from individuals and other community stakeholders to ensure that implementation is resulting in meaningful reform and that PRPD is able to sustain these reforms for generations to come.

Thank you, Your Honor.

THE COURT: Thank you. Attorney General, please.

ATTORNEY GENERAL MIRANDA: Good afternoon, Your Honor.

THE COURT: Good afternoon.

ATTORNEY GENERAL MIRANDA: I completely adhere to the recognition, the acknowledgment, that Counsel Saucedo made. From the beginning of this reform we known we're living in historic times.

Again, as I've said, at all times this is the most important project that the people of Puerto Rico are going through right now because whatever ensures peace and quality of life of all Puerto Ricans definitely has to be what motivates us the most.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

We have had the pleasure of being the legal representative of the Puerto Rico Police throughout all this time. There isn't an adversarial event in this reform. The positions that we have assumed are consonant with the aspirations of the Department of Justice, the federal Department of Justice when the complaint was filed initially. But above all they're consonant with the aspirations that Puerto Ricans have had and this administration in reaching a better police for the people of Puerto Rico.

I have to state that, even in times of fiscal crises, the governor of Puerto Rico has never shied away from his economic obligations in order that this reform be a reality.

And, Your Honor, I also wanted to share with you my appreciation and how grateful I am for the court officers who have always been willing to lend a hand on all the occasions that has been necessary, resolve any difference that has arisen to be able to reach a middle point or any part of this agreement that The Reform has had.

So, my appreciation to Your Honor, to members of the court, and to Mr. Claudio, the TCA who's been working hand in hand with us, and to all those who have a total understanding of what's the

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

applicable law in this agreement between the federal

Department of Justice and us, the Department of

Justice of Puerto Rico, the Commonwealth of Puerto

Rico, the people of Puerto Rico who really has given

us the opportunity to be able to conduct this event.

It's one that's progressive, it will take time, but

will definitely be for the betterment of the police

of Puerto Rico and its citizens. Thank you very

much.

THE COURT: Thank you, Attorney General.

Now I'm happy to present a brief biography of the governor of Puerto Rico, and then we'll go to what everybody has come here to see.

Governor García-Padilla was born on August 3, 1971. So, for whoever does the math, he recently had a birthday. And he's from Coamo but very few people know this. Even Wikipedia has this wrong because he was not born in Coamo, he was born in Ponce because there was no hospital in Coamo but he immediately moved to Coamo. Almost every governor of Puerto Rico has been born in Ponce. So, everybody who has aspirations, think about it.

He graduated from the University of Puerto
Rico with a bachelor's degree in political science
and economics. He later obtained a Juris Doctor from

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

the Inter-American University, thanks to his brother.

He was a dean at the University of Puerto Rico and he said, You're not going to apply here to study law.

As an attorney, he showed his commitment for social and civil causes be it with the College of Attorneys of Puerto Rico, as well as the Commission on Women's Affairs. Then, as we all remember, he served a four-year term as the secretary of consumer affairs, DACO, which gave him a broad knowledge of administrative affairs.

He, once again, came into public service when he became a senator. And as a member of the minority he presided over various commissions as part of the minority in that four-year term. One of the causes in which he participated was implementing a health model to tends to the needs of drug addiction to controlled substances.

Governor García-Padilla was elected in November or 2012 becoming the tenth governor of Puerto Rico. And Governor Hernández-Colón always wants me to remind everyone that he was the second youngest assuming that position.

During the months of the transition before assuming the position, as soon as he was sworn in, in January of 2013, the governor had to entertain the

offer of the then Attorney General of the United

States Eric Holder to settle a suit against the state

for the violation of fundamental rights of citizens

by the agency.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

In June of 2013, the agreement was signed in this courthouse -- well, first in Fortaleza first and then this courthouse -- for a sustainable reform for the Puerto Rico Police. Because of this, the Court has a great interest in preserving the historical testimony of the governor because it's an instrument for all of us and specifically for those who still haven't reached the table and aren't familiar with the process. We're going to have new participants from the side of the governor next year and it's important that this historical record is here showing what we've been doing the last two or three years.

So, before the governor presents himself, I want to thank Attorney Maria Teresa Rivera-Corujo, who is the advisor on public safety, for having helped coordinate this hearing and being present in all the public hearings that we've had.

Also, I wanted to let the members of the press who are here and any other persons interested that the court has a photographer and Fortaleza also has a photographer. Obviously there's no pictures

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing
allowed in this courtroom, but because this is a
historical hearing, I've allowed the pictures that
will be taken from the court which will be sent to
the monitor, Colonel Claudio. Whomever is interested
in the pictures can call him, by six o'clock they
should be there. And if Fortaleza has some pictures
they'd like to share, send it to the TCA and also to
the office of communication of Fortaleza.

Now we're ready to begin. Governor, you're an attorney. I know you haven't stepped inside a courthouse in a long time. You're not being sued or cross-examined, so if you want to make any general comment to begin and then I have a few questions. I have sent you the questions before coming in so you can have an idea of the areas I wanted to cover.

So, welcome once again. It's a pleasure to have you here.

GOVERNOR GARCÍA-PADILLA: Thank you, Your Honor. I have been wanting to say what I'm going to say for many years. May it please the Court.

THE COURT: Please go ahead. Or when you come back next year to address the Court. Welcome.

GOVERNOR GARCÍA-PADILLA: Thank, Your Honor.

And I'm already getting off script, but I would like
to thank you from the bottom of my heart for your

statements about the work that we have been doing in terms of the causes to advance the police reform, and also the statements of Attorney Saucedo on behalf of the Department of Justice of the United States of America.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

I appreciate you allowing me to complement the historical record on these hearings and on this case. I would also like to greet the officers of the Department of Justice present, as well as those of the Civil Liberties Union, the monitor Colonel Arnaldo Claudio. I would like to greet all of the officers and the people present here today.

It is an honor to appear before this Court to talk about something that's so fundamental for our people: Justice and the state of law and order.

As we have said before, we will be speaking about the police reform. It has been a very tough four-year term. We assumed a country that was in a deep crises due to excess and from postponing difficult situations and decisions. The excess, Your Honor, was not only seen in police duties but in all of the areas and departments of our government.

In five months, I will pass the baton to a new government, a new administration, that most certainly will not be the second youngest but the

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing
third youngest governor -- a government that,
contrary to my own, will receive a country that has
benefitted from all these many changes we're
proposing.

The role of Puerto Rico has been strengthened as an actor in the global economy. Pharmaceuticals are growing, medical equipment distribution is growing. We have revitalized key sectors of the economy. Agriculture has increased 30 percent in its net income. We have also received more tourists than ever before in our history. We have begun a process to restructure public debt.

This has been the biggest restructuring process in the history of the United States. So that the debt rescheduling does not risk basic services this is why the restructuring has been done, in order to ease the heavy burden that in the past was put on the shoulders of all Puerto Rican men, women, children, and grandchildren.

We want to defend our people. We gave meaning to Article II, Section 19 of the Puerto Rico constitution, the power of the Legislative Assembly. This is why I tell you, Your Honor, that we cannot separate the changes in the police force from the rest of the changes that we were forced to put into

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing place as a country.

By its own definition, we are an integrated body, a country. We have common needs and we have unique resources that are limited, as any other country. They are all part of a remand and a process of change and reform so that Puerto Rico can vary from that tough period with growth and a stronger economy.

We cannot deny the paradigms in the post-war that made us just look up to the north, but now we look to Latin America and Europe all while continuing to look north so that we may also come out of this with a restructured debt that eases the heavy burden, a debt resulting from solving immediate problems while putting future problems on the back burner. And it just came to haunt us. This is the context within which we started our four-year term, our administration. That's the context in which this suit came up and the context in which the agreement was formulated.

And so, the American Civil Liberties Union sued the Commonwealth due to the excesses that we lived for many years -- events with university students, episodes that I witnessed when I was a senator on Capitol Hill.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

On September 5, 2011, the section of civil rights in the federal justice department wrote a terrible report that it witnessed use of force, discrimination for ethnic causes and nationality by our police force, and other violations to civil liberties on behalf of the police department.

Instead of attacking the report, as a governor, I decided to attack the problems. This is what was correct and what the country demanded. We have the obligation to give the best possible police force to our people, so we cannot limit this effort to only The Reform years. The Reform must be the stepping block for this continuous action in the path of our people. And it corresponds to all administration to provide the best police force possible.

As Your Honor stated, on July 17, 2013, we reached a historical agreement with the federal justice department. It was very nice to receive the Attorney General, at the time Eric Holder, to sign that historic agreement. The most important agreement, however, was precisely the agreement we made with ourselves to make the police reform a project for our country.

Today your words, Your Honor, evidence that

this is not just an administration project, it is not only a judicial project or that of one agency or another; it is the project of our country, of the country where this court resides, where the agencies reside, where our government resides.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

We reach this agreement because the men and women of the police reform put at risk their lives every day so that our citizens who live on this island live safety. And the majority of the members of the police force do it faithfully and they do what they promised to do.

And I didn't say citizens, Your Honor, because one of the communities that presented the most claims and which are part of this suit are the communities and members our country who are not citizens but who should also receive human rights, because they are human beings and not because they come from elsewhere.

The federal justice department has reached similar agreements with police departments in other jurisdictions of the United States: Detroit, Los Angeles, New Orleans, New York City, Pittsburgh, and in Washington, D.C.

According to a report posted in The Washington Post, in November of last year most police

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

departments have tried to get extensions to comply

with the agreements with the justice department, but

the Police of Puerto Rico has complied with all of

the terms of the agreement reached with the justice

department and has never asked for an extension.

This is not random and it is a topic that I

personally follow continuously.

Moreover, as governor I have worked hand in hand with the federal justice department and the Attorney General of Puerto Rico Cesar Miranda and all of the members of the Police of Puerto Rico. This process has not been contentious. On the contrary, both parties are committed to reform the Police of Puerto Rico. This is why I thank from the bottom of my heart the personnel of the U.S. justice department and in particular the section of civil rights.

Together we have assigned priority to what needs more priority.

The police department has been part of the list of priorities which is not an extensive list.

One of our problems as a country is that we give priority to everything and when everything is priority by definition nothing really is priority.

The intrinsic nature of priorities is to put some issues above others. That list only includes health,

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing education, and safety in a broad sense. That level of priority toward The Reform and this is in my interest and that of my administration.

This is why, Your Honor, in the midst of the fiscal crisis we have sustained the budget allotted to comply with the agreement of the police reform, which is \$20 million a year. And we have complied with all of the terms such as The Moratorium Act passed on April last year and the many other fines that have been imposed in order to guarantee the continuity of the essential services our country needs. The fact that we maintained intact the budget of the police reform in the face of this critical scenario shows the level of commitment that we have with The Reform.

And, Your Honor, I would like to go further. While the fiscal crisis has forced us to reduce the budget for many agencies, the budget of the police as a department has increased. In other words, while we have been forced to cut the other operational areas of the government, we have not touched the police budget.

I would like to talk about one of the key components of this reform, and it is a key element, and this is the academy. As Your Honor already said,

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

when I came into the administration the academy was in the hands of the criminal justice and it was seen just as academic, it was autonomous from the police department of Puerto Rico. This concept created problems that surpassed the benefits.

The time of training and education is

fundamental in the life of a police officer and it is

not correct to leave this training in the hands of an

agency that, since it was autonomous, didn't have the

same interest of the country or of the police

department. Every police officer must have at least

some basic education, but the academy was not there

to support this. The police academy should provide

an experience whereby the cadet must prove if they

can live under the discipline, the code of honor and

integrity, which is essential in order to be a police

officer.

In addition, it is an opportunity for the cadet to demonstrate whether they can identify and confront situations where his life is at risk or that of others. And they must prove that they can perform in stressful situations without using excessive force or discriminating based on race, ethnicity, nationality, social conditions, ideas, religious or political beliefs, sexual orientation of the person

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing
that they intervene with. This is why I dare say
that the academy is one of the most vital resources
of the police and our country. The academy must not
exist outside of the police department.

On June 30, 2014 I approved Law 112 of that year that returned the academy into the hands of the We needed to do so. And since then the police. academy is, again, under the control of the police. This was a qualitative leap of The Reform. Law 112 we made the academy a subsidiary of the police department. The rank of auxiliary superintendent is very important and shows what we must do. Under the new norms every candidate must have at least an associate's degree from a licensed and accredited institution. The cadets receive more than 900 hours of education in police sciences, investigation techniques, tactical training, supervision, interpersonal relations with civilians, ethics in performing their duty, respect and protection of civil rights and effective communication with the communities.

With Law 112 each officer must comply with at least 12 hours of continuous education, and that is another qualitative leap. Before, the officer left the academy once they formed part of the police

that of this Honorable Court.

force. Continuous education should have been a component always. This is the way it is now, and this is the commitment that we agreed on. And we will comply in a coordinated step with the mandate of

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

In the most recent academy, March of last year, the graduates numbered 300 cadets, and they are the first to graduate from the new academy. I would have liked to graduate more cadets, but the fiscal crises avoided it.

Another reform was to settle strong bonds between the police and the communities, as you said before. This is an objective that we have been working for and not only in those communities that had a good relationship with the police officers, but we also want to establish these bonds in those communities where the relationship between the police and the communities have been a source of mistrust, prejudice and, on occasions, has resulted in violent acts.

In order to reach this agreement, starting this year the police has held 35 meetings in the 13 different police sectors. And we have met with many different organizations that defend human rights and community-based organizations such as the Civil

prominent participation.

Liberties Union and international amnesty, the center for helping Dominican Republic females, coordinator peace for women, the creative lesbian workshop, the institute for promoting human rights, the commission of rights of immigrants from the college of attorneys, and the corporation of legal services among many others. The Consulate General of the Dominican Republic in Puerto Rico has also had a

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

These meetings have served to promote the guidelines of the police department in order to deal with immigrants and also the members of the LGBT community. However, there's much to do. To develop guidelines is just the first step. Recognizing human rights is a continuous process.

Let's take the case of the United States, for example, where so much has been furthered since in the 1860s the abolition of slavery was proclaimed. And since then so much has been done to fight against discrimination, racism; and still today there are fights because of inequality and unjust treatment by the police of the African American community. This is a continuous process that is never-ending.

Since November of last year the police department has campaigned so that the people know the

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing
mechanisms available to report behavior that is not
good by the police. We have identified mechanisms
for the police and the people of Puerto Rico. For
the first time there are laws that prohibit the
police officers to name public officers. Part of the
problems that stained this new institution were
caused by politicians who were in power who forgot
that the police is not a praetorian guard that can be
ordered to attack or who in exercising their civil
rights differ from the government from time to time.

This is why on June 30, 2010 when officers, following the orders of politicians, they clubbed and attacked college students -- and I will never forget this because if somewhere should be the form for free expression it's the immediate area and surroundings of the Capitol Hill. That's what it's there for. Likewise, the intervention of the police back then because they were following instructions of partisans was the cause that created all of this use of force.

Every time that I visit a municipality, Your Honor, somebody comes to me to ask me to transfer a family member who lives away from the Metropolitan area but they work here. Sometimes their petitions are very particular that could be sustained because of health reasons or others, but sometimes they tell

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

me that they worked in the campaign; and obviously I appreciate their work in the political campaign, but this cannot be the reason to transfer somebody. I can guarantee to this court that in my administration transfers are not guided by partisan politics, and I have many examples of this, and this will continue to be so.

We have proposed legislation that strengthens prohibitions contained on ethics law and utilizes employment using government unity to further partisans ideas. On the other hand, we have ensured that the women that are in the police force can occupy positions of power. We have five women leading districts, four in precincts, two in zones, and three leading criminal investigation divisions including San Juan, which is the biggest.

The homicide division in San Juan is also led by a woman. We have ten directors of domestic violence and 12 in sexual crimes. In total 39 divisions of the police department are led by women. Actually, we have the first unit of women in the tactical divisions.

This is a historical time when there are more divisions in the police force led by women.

This is why I dare say that the police has never had

so many women in prominent positions. And I apologize superintendent but maybe this is why we have so much success now. We hope that this amount will continue increasing when we break down the walls, when merit is the only matter that promotes people in ranks.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

And I would like, Your Honor, to give you one last reflection. In the last year after the tragic events of Ferguson, Missouri, which have been replicated unfortunately in smaller cities in the U.S., we have crudely seen the force of police that shows its worst face in face of citizens that they should be protecting, and citizens that also show their worst face in front of police that should be protected.

And we have seen that the police reform is not exclusive to Puerto Rico. And honestly we don't want to reach such a breakdown level where the police and the community see each other as foes, enemies. This is why it was so important to begin this police reform and leave it well-guided. There's so much at stake.

Although I will finish my four-year period,,

The Reform has not been finished. It has brought

fundamental changes in education, training and

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing
supervision in the Police of Puerto Rico. It's also
brought new equipment, patrol cars, portable
computers, fire weapons, non-lethal weapons, as well
as an air force that is comparable and exceeds that
of any other department of any city in the United
States; and we have achieved this in the midst of the
worst financial crises in our history.

Having done so, I submit, Your Honor, respectfully to you, just as an example, as

Exhibit 1, that this was our priority. I cannot let this opportunity slip by without pubically acknowledging Superintendent José Luis Caldero for putting in his hands the future of the country and his more than three decades of experience at the service of this reform.

Thank you, Superintendent, for putting into place a plan that has been fundamental to reach the lowest criminal crime rates in the history of our country. Homicide have been reduced, Type 1, which really take the peace away from our people's minds. To date, this year, Type 1 crimes have been reduced by six percent versus last year which was the lowest in 30 years. Murders, compared to last year, have increased. However, even in face of that increase, Your Honor, this year at this rate is one of the ones

with less murders in the last 30 years. However, we are not satisfied. You should not be satisfied and no Puerto Rican men or women should be satisfied with these figures.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

I also believe that it is pertinent to say that a body that used to drag its feet investigating complaints has become a police force that from 2014 to present has investigated over 75 percent of the complaints received. And we should thank not only the superintendent but every man and woman of the police force that has made these changes possible.

Thanks to Colonel Clementina Vega for her mission to lead from her department this reform, to the Puerto Rico chapter of the American Civil Liberties Union for raising the red flag, for beginning the suit and initiating this reform. It will be senseless to even mention that this reform would have happened unless that suit was brought up in 2012.

Thanks to the U.S. State Department, specially the civil rights division, for putting their best in this process.

I would also like to acknowledge publically the Department of Justice of Puerto Rico and the attorneys who represent the Commonwealth of Puerto

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

Rico in this fundamental case in our history.

Thanks, Your Honor, and the officers of the court for supervising this reform with a great sense of justice.

You already mentioned, Your Honor, that I'm from the countryside, and we people from the country are distinguished for many things. We drag our Rs, sometimes we don't congregate words well in English, but we also make a lot of comparisons with agriculture. In these last years, Your Honor, we have cleaned the field, we have improved irrigation, we sewed the seed and you have been able to see that we've started to harvest; but harvest is also a continuous process. It does not end with the first fruit; it begins with the first fruit.

Some fruit will take a long time to reap and harvest, above all those that have to do with cultural patterns of discrimination that are so deeply rooted in our beings. Those cultural patterns that make people mock foreigners or against those that love the same but with a different orientation. Those cultural discriminations practices have been in place for many decades and breaking them will take some time.

I would request, Your Honor, very dealer for

you to continue supervising strictly this reform when this goes into the hands of the next administration in November. I would also like to request, Your Honor, to do everything in your hands so that this reform forms part of the priorities of the fiscal board to be appointed by the next president.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

In my administration we began this reform together. Your Honor, do not allow that once I finish as a governor this reform derails its direction. Please do not allow it. We have begun. The police has many successes in terms of crime reduction and recognition of human rights but there is still a long way to go.

Thank you very much, Your Honor.

THE COURT: Thank you, Governor. I'm going to make some brief comments to what you've stated and then I have a few questions. I have a lot more but obviously you've touched on it with your comments.

So before anything, I know that you talked about the role of women and The Reform and the position that they have, and I know that Superintendent Caldero is very proud of that because his wife was a police officer and she retired from the police. So he's very proud of it. So, you don't have to apologize for all of that, right,

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

1 Superintendent?

SUPERINTENDENT CALDERO: That is correct.

THE COURT: So, something else that you mentioned which is interesting sometimes things don't come out in the public light which happen behind the scenes with the attorneys when there's hearings in the court or meetings. You mentioned that there's never been an extension that's been requested in this case and that's correct.

There's been times that I know it's Friday and the document is due on Monday and the parties are working and they're all working big time. And I say why don't we give them an extra week? And the monitor has told me, no, they don't want it, they want to finish it, and they're working on it. So, contrary to any other case, criminal or civil, there's never been a request for an extension. The case has been moved according to the dates that have been set and everything's been up-to-date. And that's something that I have to highlight and it's important for me to highlight that.

And this case is also a case that has great importance for Puerto Rico. Beyond that, this case has a worldwide importance. As we're seeing in the United States the Department of Justice, since this

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

case was filed 12, 14 more cases have been filed

throughout the United States. And Ferguson was the

last one. Counsel Saucedo sends me periodically -
every time there's a new one he sends me material.

Since the statute was created for these cases there's

been 20 cases filed.

So, it's very important because Puerto Rico is the biggest jurisdiction in which a reform has taken place. And we're going to be a model not only for Puerto Rico but also for all the counties, cities, states or any jurisdiction in the United States in which this is done. And eventually worldwide this will also happen. This won't be a model just of the United States because this is a worldwide problem.

So, it's very important that we're all involved in this reform. And our roles, you as a governor, me as a judge, the monitor, the attorneys for the Department of Justice, that we're all setting a precedent that maybe your children, if one of them studies law and civil right, that they're going to study this type of case.

So, in November we have the first national meeting of the monitoring of the police. That is going to be in the State of Texas. I will be there

invited there, and the judges of federal jurisdiction are also going to participate. And the superintendent, this is the weekend before elections so obviously your presence is required. But I really thank Colonel Fraley of the academy is going to participate in that program, because I believe that we have model academy that other jurisdictions follow. And she's going to participate in the panel there also. So, I think we're going to be an example of all this which is a growing wave.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

And some things that are also very important, the Ferguson case of the United States has to do a lot with discrimination against black people. In Puerto Rico, we rarely see a racial discrimination case, be it black or white, the big problem you mentioned here is the Dominican Republic community. Our Dominican Republic community here, be it legal or illegally or in process of being legal, they've been discriminated against historically.

And also the LGBT -- I always say it wrong, but the LGBTT community have also been discriminated against. This reform also attacks that issue here south of the United States or in other areas, but here it's the equivalent of what happens over there.

I also want to highlight the ACLU, but

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing
before that there were many individual attorneys who
brought cases and the Department of Justice
represented them. Many of these cases it came to the
point of a settlement and the Attorney General saw
what happened and most of these cases were settled.
But it's very important to highlight that if it
wasn't for those attorneys and the ACLU we wouldn't
have seen all the information that eventually the
Federal Government obtained which is part of the
complaint. So, that's very important.

Reform but also in Puerto Rico the mayor of San Juan, Carmen Yulín Cruz; the mayor of Ponce, Mayita, both of them -- the mayor of Ponce participated in the public hearings but the mayor of San Juan wants to adopt -- we saw her at the graduation of the academy, and she wants to adopt administratively everything concerning The Reform because it benefits her. So, we're having an impact not only outside of Puerto Rico but in Puerto Rico. Maria Meléndez is Mayita.

So, it's very important and we have other mayors from different regions that they've stated their interest, although they're not part of The Reform, in following these steps.

Something else that I want to acknowledge

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

from your administration when you came in there was in effect several task forces which are the state police that collaborated with the federal officers and vice verse. And you, as governor, you took the decision -- you left the task forces in place. In fact, you designated additional officers.

So, this has been very important and I believe this is one of the reasons why crime has been reduced; because, if I'm not mistaken, in 2010 there were 1,200 murders and last year it was down to 600. They've gone up a little bit this year but much less than in other years. And those task forces since they were started in 2010 or 11 they've continued working, and since last term to this one murders have continued to go down. One murder is always more than enough, but this cannot be done from one day to the next.

So, it's very important the officers that you have imposed in the Federal Government because they give us a lot of assistance. Sometimes our federal officers don't speak Spanish. They have good techniques, they know how to do certain things that the officers here are not trained to do, but they work together with the state officers. And if it weren't for this concerted effort in working with the

federal officers, we wouldn't have the number of cases we have. The number of cases that you see here it's impressive.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

And something else that's impressive when you came into power and you came into the governor's office there was obviously a transition, the Attorney General changed and other public officers changed, the superintendent changed. But one of the things that I do remember for a period of a year and a half you worked with the police and the Attorney Marxuach who had been advisor to Governor Fortuño and you continued until The Reform was signed.

And I believe you were a crucial person.

And this is important because had we changed everybody and began anew with people that wouldn't know anything about this change, we would be beginning with this again. So, it's very important to acknowledge and I hope that your successor recognizes this.

We have to recognize that there's people that eventually are going to do other things but there's some people that are key and who know The Reform better than anyone. And I hope the next person who comes uses those resources; because many of these people have been committed to The Reform,

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing
it's not one administration in particular. They are
public servants who want to see this come to
fruition. So, I believe that when the next
administration comes in that these people can
contribute as much as possible. And whomever want to
continue as volunteers, I ask that they please do so
and incorporate themselves.

So with those comments I have some brief questions. Obviously you spoke of some achievements and goals that you believe are important, but which one do you think within The Reform if you could tell us -- this'll be like those talk-shows, I ask a question and you give the answer.

So within The Reform if you could tell us which one do you believe, as brief as possible, which has been the biggest achievement that you've reached in The Reform?

GOVERNOR GARCÍA-PADILLA: Well.

THE COURT: Incorporating everything you said.

GOVERNOR GARCÍA-PADILLA: Yes. Well, from the perspective of the people that represent the country, what people want from the police is that crime is reduced and that the police protect them and don't assault them. I think that the country is

feeling that there's been a change in these last years; that is, that the police is there to protect them. It's not always been successful, but it has stopped being a partisan or political discussion and has become a social one.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

The main achievement has been the police gaining the trust of the people. And it's a process, it hasn't concluded. But the trend whereby the people weren't trusting the police has been reversed. The people little by little have been trusting of the police.

THE COURT: The next question is, on

January 9th we'll know who will be your successor -
GOVERNOR GARCÍA-PADILLA: In November. We

don't have to wait that long. November 9th.

THE COURT: November 9th. When said person is going to Fortaleza to meet with you, which would you say is the biggest challenge regarding The Reform? If you were to give advise, what advise would you give your successor?

GOVERNOR GARCÍA-PADILLA: That that person has to continue The Reform, and that in order to continue The Reform that person cannot give into the political pleasure that he/she is going to feel to control the Puerto Rico Police politically. I felt

that way. Some of the things you've mentioned were true, at times ones feels political pressure that one has to resist. And the next governor, in order to continue The Reform, that person cannot give in to partisan politics pressure.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

People who today lead divisions of the police, people that are very connected -- and I don't want to state their positions -- to The Reform are people within the police who are said to be from this party or the opposing party, a party of which I have participated in elections and of which I'm a member. But one must be firm.

And when promotions are going to be given, promotions can be given to people that are in the party but it's because they are good at their jobs and that's why the raise has been given regardless of which party the person is a member. So, resisting the temptation of leading the police electorally is something that the next governor has to try and do. If they don't, this reform won't continue.

THE COURT: What role -- what is your vision? Because from my judicial perspective I like a case to reach me, I'll resolve the case. There can be an injunction permit, the order can be resolved. But this is a case in which I already issued the

judgment, the agreement, but I retained jurisdiction.

And from the point of view of a judge, sometimes I feel there's little -- and I don't say it negatively, but I think it's judicially offensive to be micromanaging the issues of the state, at least in this case, regarding the police for such a long time.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

Sometimes it could be a necessary evil for a short period of time. And now that the oversight board is coming -- until the oversight board is in place we have the oversight of Gelpí.

So, how do you see the intervention of having a monitor? Is it something positive? We all want this intervention to be as short as possible, but from your perspective, you're also an attorney, of federalism of nations which are governed with both federal and state relationships. I mean, this is the first time this happens here, but what could you mention about that?

GOVERNOR GARCÍA-PADILLA: Your Honor, I think that it's not only an issue of federalism but a separation of powers. It's not your mission to manage the Police of Puerto Rico, but the truth is that there are some facts that gave rise to complaints and they had merit and they were true. And those facts violated civil rights that created

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing some controversies which you have the duty of resolving. For the future, not for the fact in itself.

So, that's why today my petition to the Court is that The Reform not be allowed to stop. Based on the improvisation of bad practice was the result of decades of bad practices, and they won't change one day to the next. It doesn't change like that. It's no longer the police of siete maravillas [seven wonders]. It's other bad practices that harm the essence of human rights simply for being a human being independent of where he/she was born or their citizenship, independent of their sexual orientation, independent of their physical appearance.

In this case, the mission of the Court is a two-fold mission. It has to ensure some things to the country in its traditional duties of solving controversy. Let me go further. My mother says that this is where I get corso. They come from Spain.

And sometimes you have an angel on your shoulder saying, Don't say this, but you can't resist.

Without the complaint, without this case that was before you, I would have found public objection to many of the things that we've been able to reform. If it wasn't because this case is alive,

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

I would have found public opposition to return the academy to the police. I would have found opposition to depoliticize the transfers and promotions. I would have found public opposition to submit police officers to -- help me, Judge. How do you translate P.T. test? The physical test.

The first time that I proposed it as a senator I received public criticism. In fact, I was told that I should really challenge a police officer to see if I could beat him running a mile. As if that's what it was about.

So, the police reform has gone through the public scrutiny with little opposition because it's in this court. And don't let it go, Your Honor.

THE COURT: Thank you. Well, the other thing that I wanted to say, and you've mentioned it, was the de-politicization of the police. And that's important. And let me tell you something, it's interesting. I was not a presiding judge here yet, but in the eighties I was an attorney in federal court but you had the First Circuit and the Supreme Court, and the end of the eighties and beginning of the nineties there was discrimination. Every time there's a change in government, it was something that was incredible the public funds and municipal funds

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing
that were spent. And these are also things that you
would not for that.

But the Government Development Bank the money that it gave for transactions such as this was in the millions throughout the years, and this is all administrations, all municipalities. And I think it's a culture that at the central government level, just like the cases of violation of civil rights and abuse of force, have been reduced. And I think this culture is reducing. It hasn't ended, we still have cases that settle, but it's not at the volume we've seen in previous years. Let's see what happens in this change of government.

But one of the things that happened -- and this is something I've always said publically -- and also at these hearings I asked Governor

Hernández-Colón, also the superintendent, and I believe the secretary of justice as well. At the federal level we have federal employees, even judges. We have federal employees who work for the United States be they Democrat, Republicans. Whether Donald Trumps wins or whether Hillary Clinton wins, we're loyal to the Constitution and laws of the United States.

In Puerto Rico, the Hatch Act, when Sila

Calderón was governor, the administration made a mini Hatch Act. I think it was for the department of justice, the governor's office, the department of state, and even transportation; but it was just there. And I think that recently you signed a law, and when you were away the secretary of state would make their appearance saying that the Puerto Rico Aqueduct ans Sewer Authority [PRASA] and the Puerto Rico Electric Power authority [PREPA] basically they're being applied something very similar to the Hatch Act.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

My question is -- and obviously you're not running for governor again. You're not going to elections so you can maybe say things you don't want to say. But as governor for the future of Puerto Rico, the day that your sons are older and they want to work for the government or they're public servants or any other person who wants to go into government, what do you believe is the next administration should evaluate having a Hatch Act? And specifically I say it's regarding the Puerto Rico Police. Do you believe this would be something sustainable, something good and positive?

Obviously I know. And I know the other ex-governors and I've known many police officers

throughout the years. And right now sometimes you know them, and I've been helping and advancing of such and such. And it's as you said, if he wins, I'll be here, and if they lose they'll also go somewhere else.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

But in the Puerto Rico police do you think --

GOVERNOR GARCÍA-PADILLA: And if he loses, we also have to go someplace else.

THE COURT: But do you think as the superintendent does that there should be some type of Hatch Act or some type of order in the police and possibly in the rest of the government of Puerto Rico. What is being done so that these trust positions, this practice -- because here in Puerto Rico it's been years, so that it ends once and for all?

GOVERNOR GARCÍA-PADILLA: Without a doubt,
Your Honor. And in fact one of the first things I
did as governor was a law that prohibited public
employees to donate money to political parties, as
the Hatch Act states. And this was a message I had
prepared for the first gubernatorial speech. And
that was something that had to be changed. It was
declared unconstitutional.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

But regarding the intervention of politicians and the appointment and in the movement of personnel or public corporations we have been able to do so. These are two bills that we presented in our administration and restructuring of the Puerto Rico Electric Power and Authority, and these they haven't been discussed.

These are two elements that are public corporations that have been very politicized and that we turned into law and the public discussions have been very little. And I think something needs to be done throughout the government elected positions should not be an employment agency. And unfortunately the elected officials look at themselves as an employment agency, they think that that's their duty. And I think that's not correct for many reasons including for political reasons that I'll allow the Court to state.

THE COURT: Well, if you can do so, this will help your successor.

GOVERNOR GARCÍA-PADILLA: If there's a position in the police and I become a selected official and a person who, among other things, facilitate the possibility that a person from my party has that position, 20 persons from my party are

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing going to come to request that position. There's one position and I'm going to make one person happy and I'm going to make 19 others mad.

So, I thought that this practice didn't exist. I read it in a book during my studies in the law. If I'm not mistake, it was Governor Muñoz-Marín who used to say it. When it happened to me, I couldn't believe it.

recommends a person for one position and tells me that he/she is the best qualified person for that position, but then I'll receive more than one letter from that same elected official that that person's the best qualified. So, I have letters from mayors, for example, from legislators, leaders from my party for one position recommending three persons and telling me that each one of those persons is the best qualified for the position.

THE COURT: That must be that each person gave a copy of the letter and they weren't 20 other letters, and the officer and everybody was happy with that elected official.

GOVERNOR GARCÍA-PADILLA: But once that person is selected, the others get mad at the elected official.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

that should be explored. When I saw the news that the water authority and the electric power authority had taken certain measures. And I have to congratulate them publically. I've always encouraged any administration to limit this because it's an evil that still permeates. It's been reduced, but it's always around.

Okay. Another question that I had -- and for those of you who are here, we're almost done, two-thirds of the questions have been asked. One of the things that I requested that you do in this case and in order to keep informed day of day of The Reform process -- and I know that the Attorney General has told me that you and he speak almost daily and also the superintendent.

And I took this from the Morales-Feliciano case that you have an officer that comes daily to these hearings that you appointed a public safety officer to do so. And I want to ask, not only the superintendent to come and manage that the security meetings that are conducted weekly, but I also know the attorney speaks to the monitor when there's issues. There may be times when the secretary of justice if there's a crises speaks to the

superintendent and the monitor speaks with her. How useful has this been to have this position, this person appointed to the position of this practice?

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

GOVERNOR GARCÍA-PADILLA: My recommendation, if it helps in anything, is to continue with it; because just like you say in English. Hands on. In order for me to react to the needs that arise, I have to have the information. And having an officer from Fortaleza with the information up-to-date, it allows instructions to be given and they could flow easily. And it's useful in cases related to The Reform of the police and other issues.

I mean, as César Miranda has informed you -in fact, we have daily communications and with the
superintendent as well, but the follow-up of that
information is done at other levels. And there has
to be that direct contact, that continuous direct
contact.

THE COURT: Thank you. Something else that comes to mind and which has been important throughout your four year term -- and this was begun by the secretary of justice, I think the police is also like that. Previously the economy we thought it was better, there was more money for other things. Had this occurred years ago, I guarantee you that you

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

would not only have the secretary of justice, but
you'd have four attorneys. It would've happened

under any administration. You'd have four attorneys

from an incredible law firm from Washington, D.C. and

maybe several attorneys from one or two law firms

from here in Puerto Rico as co-counsel; but the

attorneys that work here have been internal

attorneys.

The attorneys from the Department of Justice here it was a career position attorney. I know that previously not only this case, but Morales-Feliciano and also in the case of the dairy industry, a lot of these a large cases. I also have the health reform, the case of the 330 centers. But they've been internal attorneys from the Department of Justice.

So, obviously this saves millions to the Government of Puerto Rico. It also gives confidence to the attorneys of Puerto Rico. And I remember with the Department of Justice there was external law firms, and I would think why don't they choose us. When I was Attorney General I would say to the governor that I was going to go to New York and I can argue this in the Second Circuit.

Do you believe that this practice has been a good one? I mean, the talent is here. You don't

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

57 Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing prove it in this case, it's been proven; but do you have anything to say about it? GOVERNOR GARCÍA-PADILLA: I think that those with the expertise which we have at the Department of Justice should continue in the Department of Justice. César Miranda refers to them as a dream team. Your Honor, it's the fact that not long ago I was also a young attorney. Sometimes I still believe it until I look at myself in the mirror. But they're totally capable and they've shown it in court. And I think that that external contracting should be limited on occasions where some expertise is needed in the law to litigate a controversy. that expert's specific expertise is not in the department, then external attorneys should be used. THE COURT: Something else that happens. Here is the TCA Colonel Claudio. He periodically

presents quarterly reports.

Quarterly; right?

TCA COLONEL CLAUDIO: Every six months.

THE COURT: Every six months. I get ahead of myself. But when I receive those reports, when the report arrives, how useful is that report? your mind -- I know you see a lot of things considered achievements that are consistently being done. There are two or three areas which have their deficiencies. And I want to make clear, usually the public looks and says, Oh, well, the TCA found such and such deficiency and this a scolding to the superintendent, and then there's an issue where there really is no issue. And it's just like when you have a son of yours who from eight classes he has five As,

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

one B plus, and a C. Then you say, okay, let's improve on the C and let's continue with the other

grades.

But how useful are these reports for you?

What do you do when you review them? What

instructions do you give? And whatever else you want
to say about that.

GOVERNOR GARCÍA-PADILLA: I read it before calling the Secretary of Justice César Miranda or Superintendent Caldero. And I read it before so I can get to know what's the opinion of the TCA, and then I talk about it with them to see what their opinion is. And sometimes they agree on what the findings are and sometimes they don't, but that's the process. If the reports of the TCA or the opinion of the secretary of justice were that everything is perfect in the police reform, I would doubt that.

I don't know if it's called the same, but

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

when I was in private practice we see the JTS. I

imagine that now it's all electronic. And I can be

in favor or against the determination of the court,

but I have to know it. I think the best analogy,

Your Honor, is to be up-to-date with what happens in

The Reform.

There's been controversy in which I've asked for them to be corrected. And there's been controversy that I have backed the decision of the superintendent, but one has to be hands-on in what's happening with The Reform to be able to react and not only to react but to be pro active in order to comply with the agreement reached with the federal Department of Justice.

THE COURT: But let me say that, as of today, I think it was yesterday in the evening, some comments were filed regarding the last report, and I think that these comments, and they're public, are excellent. They mention the areas that are most negatively stated in the report.

We're talking about, like I said, there could be some As, some Bs and some Ds, but the reaction of the Department of Justice I think has been, and throughout all this time, it's been excellent; because it's not that this happened and

this happened, it's just that we differ regarding a few things, this is the issue. But instead of going back and forth, they're saying, We're taking these steps to cure these issues and improve on this.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

And counsel is here who prepared it with the secretary of justice, and I wanted to commend them because I think that this has been -- all of them have been very good but this one has been very concise; it's eight pages and they go straight to the point.

And what the police is saying is we differ from the TCA in this or that but, no excuses, this is what we're going to do and this is what we've been doing. Do you believe that's how the government should react?

GOVERNOR GARCÍA-PADILLA: I haven't read the one from last night but, yes, it has to be like that. It has to be like that. The police reform cannot be seen in a contentious perspective -- the Court, the parties, it cannot be seen like that.

There's two parties here: The police and the country. The country has some claims and the police has a duty. The police has to comply with protecting the country and that the people feel protected by the police. Those are the parties. And

the relationship cannot be contentious. It cannot be like that.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

THE COURT: And let me comment on something you said. I'd never seen it this way but I think is very curious. As governor you represent the police but you also represent the people of Puerto Rico, so basically -- because the government of the United States is in the case but it's for the citizens, for the people of Puerto Rico, U.S. citizens and whatever foreigners that are here, but basically you are representing both parties. So, it's a sui generis role as well from your point of view, and I'd never thought of it like that.

But I want to now briefly talk about one of the subjects that's been the one that I know most about in The Reform and one of my favorite ones. All of them are very important, but this has been one I've had a lot of opportunity to go into, which is the police academy.

You've spoken about your policy and your administration regarding the police academy. And obviously this academy is important because it's backed by The Reform. I, as a judge, was not involved but it was more an agreement that was reached within the parties to have this type

 $\mbox{ Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing} \\ \mbox{ of academy.}$

And personally I went to two of the award ceremonies that occurred where the now Colonel Clementina Vega promoted. And I also went to the graduation that you had to go to Washington, D.C., we know why. But I was there and the secretary of state was there in your place, which was of all the police that were graduating including municipal police officers. And it was an incredible experience.

I also had one visit at the academy where I saw the use of batons, the use of Tasers. On another visit I wasn't there, but the monitor volunteered to be Tased, and he survived. But I think that the academy is very important.

And you also as an attorney and obviously I as a judge, and of course I am an attorney, the Puerto Rico Supreme Court constantly issues decisions based on the bill of rights; the Supreme Court of the United States also does so. Very recently one of the last opinions gives more tools the police officers to stop people and contains parameters which gives more flexibility for the Terry stops.

And if it's a case of mistaken identity, before you make a mistake -- for example, if an officer in a patrol car asks for a license, and

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing
initially when they stopped somebody it was illegal.

If the person later had something pending or a
criminal record, they can arrest them. And the
Supreme Court in a very dissenting opinion from Judge
Sotomayor, it gives a lot of flexibility to make the
arrest for these types of things.

And I think it's also important for the academy that the police officers -- for example, one of the things that I've spoken about with Colonel Fraley who is here, which is important, because tomorrow an opinion from the Supreme Court can come down that can help the police, but there can come down one saying that this type of arrest is illegal.

Just like you said, someone entered the academy and they retired 30 years later, and they would hit someone with the nightstick like they learned 30 years ago. And if it's not legal, then the decision of the Supreme Court they don't know it. And I believe the academy will help tremendously with this endeavor in the sense that there's lawyers, officers that must be instructed that that practice cannot be done anymore. Because it isn't enough to say that it's a memorandum, they have to go back to the academy to be trained.

What do you believe regarding that? I think

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

you agree with me, but I think that the academy is

one of the most important things we have here.

GOVERNOR GARCÍA-PADILLA: Yes. It has its duty. We also encourage police officer to have an academic degree. The academy doesn't handle that. When they already at the academy they must already know that. So, if a person of that culture arrives at the police academy, it's not our job to give them that academic degree. We have to train them as police officers.

So, I remember that beginning the new academy a cadet complained that he had to work a lot. And I remember the answer that the colonel gave publically, she said, "This isn't a summer camp." And I thought it was very eloquent. We're going to train police officers there, men and women, who must be prepared to react accordingly in situations of a lot of stress, in situations of a lot of complexity.

Recently I was informed by the superintendent and the secretary of justice of a case very recently where some police officers did not tend to the intervention they had to do where a person that was transsexual was involved in this situation. And what this shows us is that we have continuous work to do with the

police just like military personnel have to go to continuing education for training, just like attorneys have to go to continuing education, just like doctors have to go to continuing education.

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

So, the duties of the police officer in our society cannot continue to be -- and thank God we're seeing less and less cases of police misconduct.

They're function is vital in our society. So, it's not only the 900 hours that they have to graduate -- more than 900 plus hours. It's not only the training that they receive there, but it's the training they have to receive every year.

Just to give you an example, on a particular day the Supreme Court resolved that one must have probable cause to go into the rights of privacy when intervening with a citizen. That just happened one day, it hadn't happened before. And one day the Supreme Court of Puerto Rico decided that before arresting somebody or while under arrest you had to tell them that they had a right to remain silent, that anything they say can be used against them in a court of law, that they had a right to an attorney.

And then the Supreme Court in the case of Miranda versus Arizona, if I'm not mistaken, they added that if they don't have an attorney, one will

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

be provided for you. But that wasn't there before.

So, police officers who continue arresting -- and I imagine it still happens in court -- have the case thrown out because the admission of a detainee, if challenged when it was submitted, the police officer had not read that person their rights. So, that's something the police officer has to know; he/she has to be trained to do it. One does what one is trained to do. So, not only do I agree, it's a requirement which doesn't work without The Reform.

THE COURT: Well, Governor, it's almost three o'clock and I know that you have many other commitments.

GOVERNOR GARCÍA-PADILLA: I prefer to be here than to tend to some of the other commitments.

THE COURT: I can give you an injunction and you can stay here until November 9th.

GOVERNOR GARCÍA-PADILLA: Preferably in one of the other rooms that are more protected, I have no problem.

THE COURT: Well, thank you very much.

You're excused. And I'll ask if any other parties

wants to react to any of this. We haven't concluded

the hearing, but, Governor, you may be excused. And

within the next four-year term the monitor and I

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing would love to hear from you again so you can share 1 2 your perspective on The Reform. Thank you. 3 GOVERNOR GARCÍA-PADILLA: Thank you, Your Honor. Permission to withdraw. Can I be excused, 4 5 Your Honor. 6 THE COURT: Yes you may. Granted. 7 Well, before recessing, I would like to give 8 a brief opportunity, a minute or two, to the 9 secretary of justice and Mr. Saucedo, if they want to 10 make any last remarks before we close our hearing. 11 And the monitor, I'll give you 30 seconds because if 12 I don't give him a limit, he can be here until 5:00. 13 So, if the monitor wants to make a very brief 14 comment, as well as any other party, you're welcome. 15 Mr. Saucedo. 16 MR. SAUCEDO: Your Honor, we want to thank 17 the Court again for giving us all an opportunity to 18 listen to the governor and to listen about his 19 priorities and what worked and what needs to remain 20 as part of this case. 21 All of these cases demand a lot of attention around the country. Today we issued findings in 22 23 Baltimore, Maryland after an extensive investigation 24 there. So, this work is difficult but it's

necessary. And we want to thank the Commonwealth for

25

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing being a partner with us and implementing this agreement.

THE COURT: And I think having the governor here come to the hearing voluntarily sets a precedent; because you have mayors, city officials, who may not want to come voluntarily, and at least you can say if the governor comes, there's no reason why you cannot come. So, thank you very much.

Attorney Miranda.

attorney General Miranda: Your Honor, I echo the commitment of Attorney Saucedo on behalf of the federal department of justice. This is a matter of working as a team for the people of Puerto Rico.

It has been my honor to work directly in this group and I am extremely proud of the work done by the attorneys of the justice department. They have been fully devoted and committed to the police department. They have identified the communities that have clamored for their rights to be heard. We are not here to deviate the knowledge of the people when there's a violation. When there is a violation, we want it to be known. And this is the instruction to all of the attorneys of the Department of Justice. We're not here to hide anything.

Recently there was a case against a

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing transsexual young person and we took immediate action. When Mr. Claudio, the TCA, points out anything we're not going to hide anything. We're going to correct it. This is what the people of Puerto Rico can expect from each one of us.

And I thank you for mentioning the participation of the young attorneys of the justice department. We have much talent in Puerto Rico. You were the solicitor general of this country and you know all of the talent that we have. And these attorneys are proud to represent the people of Puerto Rico and they are proud to safeguard the interest of the people.

This is the position we had and we will continue assuming this position and always in harmony with the TCA. The police department and the representatives of the justice department, and obviously with your support, Your Honor, which has been very, very good for us and we appreciate it. It's invaluable.

THE COURT: Thank you very much. Yes, for purposes of the record, procurador general in English is solicitor general.

We're going to conclude now with some brief comments from the TCA. He didn't know I was going to

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing

ask him to speak, but since he's here he's free to

make some brief comments, and any question that you

want to ask the TCA about this hearing in particular

he has been authorized by me to address the press

after we conclude this session.

And the last thing I want to say before I forget, this is the fourth public hearing. This fourth public hearing will continue on September 1st and 2nd in Mayagüez. The reason why we did this special session is because to take the governor to Mayagüez he had to go in a car for two hours or in a helicopter, and that will be too cumbersome for him. This is why we held this special session here, but this is part of the public hearing in Mayagüez. And once again, we commend the governor for being here. We thought it would be an hour and he was here two hours. So, the fourth public hearing will continue September 1st and 2nd in the west coast in Mayagüez.

So, Mr. Claudio, you're the only thing that keeps us here from leaving. Take your time, but whether you speak in English or Spanish, any commentaries are welcome.

TCA CLAUDIO: Thank you, Your Honor. And I thank Your Honor for giving us the opportunity to express ourselves in front of you, the parties, and

 $\label{eq:part 1-Fourth Public Hearing} \enskip \part 1- Fourth Public Hearing \\$ the superintendent.

But there's some people here who are also so important. We have representatives of the Dominican community, Mr. Rodriguez. We have Papo Christian who is also present here. We also have Tati Escobar from Ponce --

THE COURT: So, we'll probably see them in Ponce again.

TCA CLAUDIO: Yes. This is a team effort between the TCA, the police department or the secretary, and the community. I want to say that the conversations with the superintendent will continue. They are fun, they fruitful. And yesterday we had a specific meeting regarding some operations that obviously we cannot mention today, but these are the times that people should understand that there is daily conversation with the police department of Puerto Rico.

I've always said that Colonel Clementina

Vega and her reform team, the TCA team, us, we are in constant communication and we meet every month with the new attorneys, like they say, to forge the future of the police department in Puerto Rico in terms of policies, general orders, instruction, training, philosophy, professionalizing this elite group that

Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing my father was a part of. On his behalf we assure 1 2 Your Honor that my team will move on and continue 3 this mission performing so that this reform takes 4 place. 5 And with the governor's declaration today, his statements, and with the department of justice 6 7 through Mr. Saucedo with the secretary of justice 8 César Miranda, I believe toddy we have solidified a 9 crucial moment within the police reform so that this 10 will become a reality not only for us but for the 11 people of Puerto Rico. 12 THE COURT: Thank you. And we have hereby 13 concluded these proceedings. Tomorrow we will go to 14 Ponce, Puerto Rico and we'll be continue discussing 15 The Reform for the health department. We will 16 continue there tomorrow. Thanks for being here and 17 see you soon. 18 (Public Hearing concluded at 3:03 p.m.) 19 20 21 22 23

24

25

```
Part 1 - Fourth Public Hearing
 1
     UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 2
                 ΟF
                                      )ss.
 3
            PUERTO RICO
 4
 5
 6
 7
                             CERTIFICATE
 8
 9
10
               I, EVILYS E. CARRIÓN-ESQUILÍN, hereby
     certify that the proceedings are contained fully and
11
12
     accurately, to the best of my ability, in the notes
13
     recorded stenographically by me through the use of
14
     Spanish interpreters, at the public hearing in the
15
     above matter; and that the foregoing is a true and
16
     accurate transcript of the same.
17
18
                           /s/ Evilys E. Carrión-Esquilín
19
                           EVILYS E. CARRIÓN-ESQUILÍN, RPR
                           Official Court Reporter
20
                           United States District Court
                           Federal Building, Room 200
21
                           San Juan, Puerto Rico 00918
                           787-772-3377
22
23
24
25
```